

PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Notes of Working Group Meeting

Date : 3 November 2022 (Thursday)
Time : 10 a.m.
Venue: Conference Room A, 21/F Harbour Building

Present

Chairman: HUANG Jihe General Manager / Vessel Traffic Services,

Members: CHAN Hung-tai Hong Kong Liner Shipping Association
Chan Kam-foo Shipping Agencies
LAM Wing-chiu Container Terminal Operators
CHANG Chi-wai, Robson Dry Bulk Cargo Operators
LAU Yiu-ming Oil Terminal Operators
ZHONG Ying Dockyard Industry
Ms LEI Ho-yan, Angelina Tug Operators
Capt LI Yongzheng Master Mariner
Capt CHAN Kam-wing Master Mariner
Capt WANG Chi-cheong Licensed Pilot

Secretary: Ms Athena LIU Executive Officer (General & Committee),
MD

In attendance

Capt CHAN Tak-kei Hong Kong Pilots Association (“HKPA”)
Capt LAM Wai-ming HKPA
CHAN Ming-kwong HKPA
Andrew BRIDSON Representative of the LNG Project
Raymond NG Representative of the LNG Project
Miss Iris YIU Senior Marine Officer/Vessel Traffic Centre
George TANG Marine Manager (“MM”) / Pilotage, MD

Absent with apologies

Members: ZHANG Hongwen Hong Kong Shipowners Association
LI Yubin Break Bulk Cargo Operators
Capt TSANG Cheuk-yin, Joe Master Mariner
PI Xiangzhong Surveyor of Ships (Engineer) / Seafarers and
Examination (2)

I. Opening Remarks

The Chairman extended his welcome to all members.

II. Confirmation of notes of the last meeting

2. The notes of the last meeting held on 27 May 2022 were confirmed without amendment.

[Post-meeting note: The meeting notes were uploaded to the website of Marine Department on 25 November 2022.]

III. Discussion item

PACWG Paper No. 2/2022 – Proposed Berthing Guidelines for the Hong Kong Offshore Liquefied Natural Gas Terminal

3. Capt LAM Wai-ming, HKPA, presented the paper together with the preliminary proposed draft of the berthing guidelines for the Hong Kong Offshore Liquefied Natural Gas Terminal (HKOLNG Terminal).
4. Ms LEI Ho-yan, Angelina, representing Tug Operators, enquired about the tugs required for the berthing/unberthing. Capt LAM confirmed that total HP would be used for the tugs requirement during the operation. Ms LEI welcomed the flexibility to allow even a little lower HP of tugs used in view of the market availability at that time.
5. Mr Chan Kam-foo, representing Shipping Agencies, expressed his view that given the traffic in the vicinity, it may be worthwhile to consider to lower the number of tugs required. He enquired HKPA the cost to remain one (1) pilot on board during the vessel's stay at berth.
6. The Chairman also enquired about the purpose of General Remarks 1 regarding the One (1) pilot to remain board during the vessel's stay at berth. Capt LAM responded that the detention cost of each pilot would be used for calculation. It was the proposal from the Consultant to allow the pilot to

perform the standby duties on board considering that the allowed response time is short. Capt CHAN Tak-kei, HKPA, added that the pilot was required to provide anchorage service during the vessel's stay at the terminal. With clarification from HKPA that the one (1) pilot remaining on board during the vessel's stay was not performing pilotage services, it was agreed in the meeting to remove the General Remarks 1.

7. The Chairman enquired about the proposed declared depth of 15.5m at Turning Basin. Capt LAM advised that this part was not yet updated to reflect the latest proposal and advised that no turning basin would be adopted. It was agreed in the meeting to delete the wording of "Turning Basin / Berth".
8. In response to the Chairman's enquiry on the LOA Max. 350m, Mr. Andrew BIRDSON, representative of the LNG Project, confirmed that the terminal can handle ships of LOA 350m at the maximum. He also told that the east and west berths could both accommodate the Floating Storage and Re-gasification Unit (FSRU) and LNG Carrier.
9. For the Draft, Capt LAM advised to revise the Max. Draft to 12.5m (min 15% UKC) to stay in line with the current berthing guideline. In this aspect, the Chairman advised the meeting that the Marine Department would propose to establish a new temporary fairway and conduct a survey along the proposed route. The meeting welcomed the advance information from the Chairman.
10. It was agreed in the meeting the Time of the terminal would be Day HW-2 to HW+1.
11. For the tugs, since the rendezvous location would be indicated by the agent when placing order with the tug operators, both HKPA and Ms. LEI agreed to only include 4 tugs in the berthing guideline by removing "including 1 escort" and the remark on tugs' standby for simplicity. The meeting has agreed to this.
12. Regarding the remarks of 2 pilots required, the Chairman enquired the roles of the 2 pilots on board. Capt LAM advised that 2 pilots were necessary to handle the 4 tugs required during the pilotage. It was the normal practice of the

Liquefied Natural Gas trade to engage 2 pilots to carry out several pilotage duties on board, including VHF communication with the Vessel Traffic Centre (VTC). The chief pilot would be responsible for navigating the ships while the co-pilot would assist in monitoring the performance of the chief pilot. Mr LAU Yiu-ming, representative of Oil Terminal Operators, supplemented that there is a requirement of 2 pilots for piloting oil tankers to and from some oil terminals in Hong Kong. In this regard, SMO/VTC advised that the master on board is usually responsible for the reporting to the VTC, including the time of the pilot on board, and information of calling-in point as well as the anchorage. The Chairman supplemented that the whole proposed route is within one VHF sector only, i.e. the South Lantau sector, LNG carrier and FSRU are not required to make calling-in point report or sector change report to VTC when navigating along the proposed route. In normal cases, few VHF communication between LNG carrier/FSRU and VTC is expected.

13. For the proposal of two pilots, Capt CHAN Kam-wing, a master mariner, advised that engagement of 2 pilots on board would undoubtedly add financial burden to the shipowners. In fact, the deck officers on board the ships are also responsible for the liaison work. Capt WANG Chi-cheong, a licensed pilot, advised that the pilotage task involves a new ship along a new route that no pilots had tried before. For safety reason, some selected senior pilots of HKPA would attend appropriate simulation trainings for the berthing and unberthing the terminal.
14. In response to the safety concerns expressed by the HKPA side, the Chairman added that there were tugs nearby ensuring the safe and smooth manoeuvring at the sharp turning point of the proposed route. The master on board the ships should be responsible for arranging sufficient hands to maintain proper lookout during the whole passage. In this sense, the roles of the co-pilot can be taken up by other persons including the master and other deck officers.
15. Capt LAM of HKPA reiterated that the proposed route was new to pilots and the proposal to engage 2 pilots are for the sake of marine safety. Mr. Andrew BIRDSON, representative of the LNG project, added that it is a standardised practice in the

sector to engage 2 pilots given the additional financial risk of each ship. 2 pilots were considered to help address the safety concern. In response to the above, the Chairman advised that upon his gathered information, there was only 1 pilot required for LNG carriers in the neighbouring ports, i.e. in Zhuhai and in Mirs Bay of Shenzhen. He shared the meeting that the route distance for the HKOLNG Terminal and the relatively low traffic density situation in that vicinity are similar to those in the waters of Mirs Bay. Therefore, he questioned in this regard about the common practice as claimed by the HKPA and the project representatives. The Chairman also suggested the meeting to consider the definition of pilot as provided in the Pilotage Ordinance, and to consider on whether the services provided by the co-pilot should be regarded as pilotage service according to the Pilotage Ordinance given his roles mentioned and that he is not to control or in charge of ship's navigation.

16. In addition to Capt LAM's advice that the co-pilot would monitor the chief pilot's performance on navigational matter, Mr. Raymond NG, representative of the LNG project, concurred with the view given it would be the first LNG terminal in Hong Kong. He advised that resources should be used to secure safety. The Chairman responded that he did not agree to the view that 2 pilots necessarily mean higher standard of safety and enquired how to handle in case the view of the two pilots on board were different. Mr. CHAN Kam-foo advised the meeting that navigational safety was undoubtedly of paramount importance and the meeting could consider the matter in terms of the traffic flow in the vicinity. In response to Mr. LAU Yiu-ming's enquiry on human error, the Chairman responded that it was the job of the master to oversee the ship's safety, he is required to give correct orders and shall take over the ship's navigation control when he believes that the duty pilot is not performing his duties properly. There was indeed a bridge team on board to support the operation.
17. Mr. Andrew BIRDSO concurred that there are masters onboard during the voyage and undertook to provide more information on the requirement of number of pilots in other ports. He added that there was requirement in the Environmental Impact Assessment submitted to the Environmental Protection Department to secure 2 pilots to prevent environmental hazard

caused.

[Post-meeting note: Emails were sent to HKPA in November 2022 seeking their provision of document/information to supplement the requirement of 2 pilots in the Environmental Impact Assessment as suggested by the LNG Project Representative. HKPA sent a section of the EIA on Design Safety which did not sufficiently substantiate the requirement of 2 pilots.]

18. For General Remarks 2 to 7, the meeting has gone through one by one. It was agreed to keep General Remarks 2, 4 and 5 but to delete 3, 6 and 7 for simplicity sake.
19. Given that no unanimous view can be gathered in the meeting for the requirement of 2 pilots, the Chairman suggested members to provide their view via email circulation on whether to further discuss the matter in the PAC Working Group with more information to be provided or submit the paper with remarks of the comments collected from members to PAC for consideration. The deadline of the circulation would be noon 4 November.

[Post-meeting note: An email was circulated to members on 3 November afternoon. By the deadline, out of 10 members joined the meeting, 9 of them opted to submit to PAC for discussion. There was one member opted to further discuss the matter in PAC Working Group.]

20. MM/Pilotage invited Ms. LEI to share the tug information with other tug operators. Ms. LEI said she would share with other tug operators on the discussion so far.

IV. Any Other Business & Adjournment of meeting

21. There was no other business. The meeting was adjourned at 12:30 p.m.

V. Date of next meeting

22. The date of next meeting would be announced in due course.

Distribution list

Chairman, PAC Working Group
Members, PAC Working Group
HKPA
Representative of the LNG Project
Senior Marine Officer/Vessel Traffic Centre, MD
MM/Pilotage, MD

Committee Unit
Marine Department
Ref.: L/M (5) in MD-COM-F01-000-02A-001