

## PILOTAGE ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Ref. : HQ/COM 928/29 (16)

### Minutes of the Pilotage Advisory Committee Meeting

Date : 5 September 2003 (Friday)  
Place : Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building  
Time : 2:30 p.m.

#### Present

Chairman:	Mr. R F TUPPER	Deputy Director of Marine
Member:	Capt. Joseph FONSEKA	Master Mariner
	Mr. CHEUNG Shun-hing	Representing Break Bulk Cargo Operators
	Mr. MA Yan-kwong	Representing Containers Terminal Operators
	Mr. Elman LAM (on behalf of Mr. Sam ROSE)	Representing Dry Bulk Cargo Operators
	Mr. WONG Yiu-kwong	Representing HK Liner Shipping Association
	Capt. SO Ying-kit	Representing HK Pilots Association
	Mr. YOUNG Yick-sing	Representing HK Shipowners Association
	Capt. WU Ka-shun	Representing Tug Operators
	Mr. LEE Ka-mo	AD/PC, Marine Department
	Mr. SIN Tak-cheung	GM/VTS, Marine Department
	Mr. FAN Wai-biu	S/PSC, Marine Department
Secretary:	Ms. Shirley HO	ADS/C&G, Marine Department

#### In Attendance

Mr. Raymond CHENG (on behalf of Mr. Terrence Sit)	HK General Chamber of Commerce
Capt. LAW Kwun-pan	HK Pilots Association (HKPA)
Capt. TANG Chiu-hung	-ditto-
Mr. SHUM Yum-pui	-ditto-
Mr. Tony LI Tai-fai	MO/Pilotage, Marine Department

#### Absent with Apologies

Capt. LI Kwan-wood	Master Mariner
Mr. NG Jim-mi, Jimmy	Master Mariner
Mr. LI Pok-yan	Representing Dockyard Industry
Mr. CHUI Hing-cheung	Representing Oil Terminal Operators
Capt. CHAN Shui-hoi	Representing HK Pilots Association

## **OPENING REMARKS**

1. The Chairman welcomed all present and particularly introduced the following attendees-
  - a) Capt. Joseph FONSEKA, who was appointed to replace Capt. Alan LOYND as a PAC member in the capacity of “a master mariner with command experience” w.e.f. 1.9.2003; and
  - b) Mr. Elman LAM and Mr. Raymond CHENG, who were attending the meeting on behalf of Mr. Sam ROSE and Mr. Terrence SIT respectively.
2. The Chairman told the meeting that Capt. CHAN Shui-hoi, Mr. CHUI Hing-cheung, Capt. LI Kwan-wood, Mr. LI Pok-yan, and Mr. Jimmy NG were not able to attend the meeting and had sent apologies for absence.

## **AGENDA ITEMS**

### **I. Confirmation of Minutes of Last Meeting**

3. The minutes of the last meeting held on 9 June 2003 were confirmed with the following amendment:

**To change the word “agreements” to “arrangements” in line 5 of paragraph 16 on page 5.**

### **II. Interviewing of Apprentice Pilot**

4. The applicants, Mr. CHAN Tak-kei and Mr. NG Kam-ming, Alick, who had already passed the necessary medical examination, were asked in separate sessions to brief members of their own background. Having asked the two applicants some relevant questions, members were satisfied with their qualifications and experience and agreed to recommend them to the Pilotage Authority for registration as apprentice pilots.
5. Capt. Joseph FONSEKA pointed out that it was essential for pilots to have good language skills because they had to communicate effectively and frequently with masters of different nationalities. Capt. FONSEKA observed and the Chairman agreed that there was room for improvement for Mr. Alick NG to enhance his language proficiency

and confidence building. Mr. SHUM Yum-pui said that Mr. Alick NG would be reminded of the comments given by the members and the need to take further relevant training courses for his self-enrichment.

(Post-meeting notes: Mr. CHAN and Mr. NG registered as apprentice pilots on 8.9.2003.)

### **III. Presentation of PAC Papers**

#### **PAC Paper No. 6/2003 “Proposed Amendments to the Berthing Guidelines”**

6. Mr. T C SIN gave members a brief outline of the details of the 17 proposed amendments to the Berthing Guidelines. Mr. SIN explained and the Chairman supplemented that it was an ongoing process to review the Berthing Guidelines from time to time, involving seeking the views of ship owners, liners association, pilots and other parties and authorities. The Marine Department (MD) and the HKPA had reviewed experience using the existing guidelines, change of conditions, availability of real time information and new technology being applied, all of which are factors that may necessitate proposals to amend the guidelines for discussion at the PAC Working Group. These 17 amendments were proposed and discussed at length in the Working Group and recommended for adoption only after a long on-trial period.
7. Mr. MA Yan-kwong enquired about the proposed amendments for point (5) at the general remarks in Chapter: 2 regarding the depth of berth provided in the guidelines declared by the berth operators. Mr. T C SIN replied that it had been the MD’s intention to add in a row of exact depths of berths on each page but the present amendment allowed flexibility and easy updating by berth operators.
8. Capt. Wu Ka-shun said that the amendments consisted principally of increase of vessel length and drafts, reduction of number of working pilot on board and reduction of use of tugs. He raised strong objections to the proposals as he considered they might seriously affect the navigation safety and port operation of HK waters. He commented that the amendments were proposed mainly based on the practical experience of the pilots but he queried whether all pilots were involved in supporting this suggested amendments and agreeing to this change. Capt. WU stated that he did request detailed information that led to the proposed changes and tug operators had no objection to looking further into the amendments and suggested that the proposal could be further studied within the Working

Group.

9. Capt. So Ying-kit responded that every pilot had the opportunity to test these proposed changes and in fact had practiced them over the past year. A majority of the pilots were consulted and he had so far received no objection to the proposed changes. Sufficient trials had proved that the changes were safe and practical.
10. Mr. Y P SHUM clarified that the HKPA's representative sitting on the PAC were representing the pilots as a whole.
11. Mr. T C SIN replied Capt. WU that the HKPA had already provided detailed information for members' consideration at the Working Group and the practical trials over a year had spoken for the feasibility and practicability of the proposed amendments.
12. Mr. K M Lee pointed out that reduction of tugboats and co-pilots on board did not necessarily mean a decrease of navigational safety but it was certain that the operating cost would be reduced. He emphasized that in no way would MD compromise safety but all had to be practical. Resources should be put in suitable places. To this end, he expressed his thanks to HKPA for reviewing and proposing constructive amendments to the Berthing Guideline for a more friendly and cost effective maritime environment.
13. Mr. MA Yan-kwong raised that the Berthing Guidelines stated the minimum requirements only. Additional resources were always welcome to be employed by ship masters if and when they wished and required.
14. The Chairman concluded that the proposed amendments had been adequately considered, tested, on trial and extensively discussed. Having been in use for over one year, the proposal was proven to be practical and effective. He thanked members for spending so much time to discuss it at the Working Group meetings. The Chairman highlighted that the masters could order additional tugs or co-pilots at any occasion if they wished. There were definitely no restrictions on this as stated in the Berthing Guidelines. Capt. Wu's comments were noted and recorded. With agreement from the majority of the attending members, the paper was endorsed.
15. Mr. Y P SHUM confirmed that, following the endorsement of the paper, a new and updated version of the Berthing Guideline would be printed and issued to relevant

parties. Mr. T C SIN supplemented that all users could have an access to the updated Berthing Guidelines through MD website.

#### **IV. Any Other Business**

##### **(i) Report of Board of Discipline (BOD) Case**

16. The Chairman briefed that one BOD had been arranged since last PAC meeting held on 9 June and invited Mr. T C SIN to give members a brief account of the case.
17. Mr. T C SIN reported that, for BOD case 2/2003, M.V. “Bai An 6” collided with M.V. “Larasati” in the Western Fairway on 5 May 2003. A BOD was appointed by the PA to examine the incident and the following conclusions were finally reached –
  - a) a caution in writing was issued to the pilot of M.V. “Bai An 6”; and
  - b) a warning in writing, which shall be entered in record but shall be removed 12 months after its entry, was issued to the pilot of M.V. “Larasati”.
18. The Chairman thanked Capt. SO Ying-kit and Capt. LI Kwan-wood for giving their valuable time and expertise while serving on the Board.

##### **(ii) Provisional Berthing Guideline for CT9**

19. Mr. Tony LI drew members’ particular attention that an information sheet on provisional berthing guideline for CT9 (on trial) as at 28 August 2003 had been tabled for members’ information.

#### **V. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

20. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 4 p.m. The date of next meeting would be announced in due course.