

Minutes of a meeting of the Pilotage Advisory Committee

Date : 3 February 1999
Place: Conference Room (A), MD HQs
Time: 10:00 a.m.

Present

Chairman :	Mr. M. C. TSANG	Deputy Director of Marine
Member :	Capt. Alan Loynd	Master Mariner
	Mr. Steve Y.O. CHOR	Master Mariner
	Mr. LAM Tsan-wa	Representing the Hong Kong Pilots Association
	Mr. George Windram	Representing Dockyard Industry
	Capt. LEE Tai-kuen	Representing H. K. Liner Shipping Association
	Mr. John Y. C. LEE	Representing the Container Terminal Operators
	Capt. WU Ka-shun	Representing Tug Operators
	Capt. CHEUNG Hon-ye	Representing HK Ship Owners Association
	Capt. CHEN Shi-zhou	Representing Break Bulk Cargo Operators
	Mr. K. M. LEE	Marine Department
	Mr. T. C. SIN	"
	Mr. M.J. Wareham	"
Secretary :	Mr. Michael YEUNG	"

In Attendance

Mr. P.J. WU	HK Pilots Association Ltd.
Mr. SIU Wai-lim	"
Mr. CHAN Shui-hoi	"
Mr. Kenneth CHOW	China Light & Power
Mr. Peter S. L. LAW	Highways Department
Ms. Helen LEUNG	"
Mr. Steward Davis	Consultants, Mott Connell Ltd.
Mr. Henry Rowe	"
Mr. T. Y. LAU	Project Manager/HKI & I, TDD
Mr. Peter Neville-Jones	Consultants, BMT
Mr. Richard Colwill	"
Mr. George KWOK	Marine Department
Mr. W. C. HUI	"
Mr. M. T. WAN	"
Mr. CHAN Yu-biu	Apprentice Pilot

Apologies

Mr. PAU Sai-hung	Representing the Hong Kong Pilots Association
Capt. Duncan Telfer	Master Mariner
Mr. WONG Tat-keung	Representing Dry Bulk Cargo Operators
Mr. Rolo Stokkmo	Representing the Oil Terminal Operators

I. Chairman's Opening Remarks

M1661 1. The Chairman welcomed all members and introduced –

Capt. CHEUNG Hon-yeo representing HK Shipowners Association vice Capt. Keen; Mr. LAM Tsan-wa, Chairman of HKPA, representing HK Pilots Association; and Messrs. SIU Wai-lim and CHAN Shui-hoi attending the meeting as observers.

II. Confirmation of the minutes of the last meeting

M1662 2. The minutes of the meeting held on 25 November 1998 were confirmed with no amendments.

III. Interviewing Apprentice Pilot

M1663 3. Mr. LAM Tsan-wa briefed members on the background of the applicant, Mr. CHAN Yu-biu. Mr. CHAN was then introduced for the interview and members were satisfied with his maritime training, ship handling experience and employment history. The meeting agreed to recommend him to the Pilotage Authority for registration as apprentice pilot subject to Mr. CHAN passing his medical examinations. (Post meeting notes: Mr. CHAN passed his medical examination and had registered as apprentice pilot)

IV. Presentation of PAC Papers

(i) PAC Paper 1/99 “Alignment of the Tsing Lung Suspension Bridge”

M1664 4. The proposed alignment of the Tsing Lung Bridge was a section of the Route 10 that would form part of the strategic route between Hong Kong Island and Yuen Long. The Marine Traffic Impact Assessment Study for the Feasibility Study of the bridge was first presented to PAC on 14 May 1997 (PAC Paper No. 4/97 refers).

5. Mr. Steward Davis briefed members on the physical aspects of the Bridge with particular focus on the northern tower that would be located 100 meters offshore in the Ma Wan Channel. Mr. Henry Rowe then explained the construction and operational impacts on years 2006 and 2011. He confirmed that there would be navigational lights on the bridge.

(ii) PAC Paper 2/99 “Green Island Development Project”

M1665 6. Two presentations on the Green Island Development Project had been made to PAC on 3 June 1998 and 16 September 1998 respectively (PAC Paper No. 2/98 and 6/98 refer).

7. Mr. Richard Colwill updated members on the latest developments. Capt. Alan Loynd commented that vessels berthing at the northern face of the reclamation would be affected by wash caused by passing traffic. Mr. WU Ka-shun reminded the consultants that a new design of vertical seawall comprising two chambers could reduce reflected waves by about 45%. Mr. WU was concerned that the high-rise buildings at the NW corner of the reclamation might obstruct the views of small vessels navigating inshore.

8. Members expressed their concern on the position of the WQIA. Mr. LAM Tsan-wa was of the view that WQIA should be positioned outside or at the boundary of the harbour in order to minimize unnecessary vessel movements inside the harbour. Mr. Colwill revealed to members that the position would be a temporary one that might last about 5 to 10 years and the permanent position should be at the North Lamma Anchorage. Mr. LAM reminded the consultant that current wave situation at the Western Anchorages might not be so suitable for small river trade vessels.

(Post meeting notes: the consultants had reviewed the issue with concerned government departments and recommended relocating the WQIA to north Lamma. Their recommendation is yet to be accepted by the Steering Group on the development project.)

V. Matters arising from previous minutes

(i) Review of the Round Island (Ngan Chau) Pilot Boarding Station (M1652 refers)

M1666

9. Mr. LAM Tsan-wa reported that HKPA had officially given up the Ap Lei Chau site. He further reported that their aim would be to identify an operation base at the Green Island Development Area which should be in a better strategic position than Ap Lei Chau. Members supported to bring this prolonged pursuit to an end and this item was deleted from the agenda.

(ii) Performance Measure of Pilots (M1653 refers)

M1667

10. Mr. LAM Tsan-wa informed the meeting that a 'Check Pilot' system was suggested by the DNV Consultant to assess pilots' performance in addition to the use of accident rate as a performance indicator. Mr. P. J. WU added that periodic checks would be conducted by their internal audit team to cover items such as accident rate, number of complaints, punctuality, check ride and annual survey to shipping agencies and masters. Members considered that this check list would be quite sufficient for the purpose.

11. Mr. T. C. SIN supported HKPA's approach and suggested that further indicators to measure the pilots' performance could be explored later if necessary. MO/Pilotage would also conduct 'check rides' and offer his advice on ways to achieve improvements. The meeting agreed to adopt the present system until something better came up. This item was deleted from the agenda.

(iii) Duty Pilot at the VTC (M1654 refers)

M1668

12. Mr. George KWOK tabled statistics of accidents involving vessels under pilotage for the years 1993–1997 for members' information (Statistics attached at Appendix I). He reported that the review indicated that none of the accidents was due to failure in communication between the pilot on board with VTC. Capt. Alan Loynd remarked that the accident rate was indeed superb and probably the lowest all over the world, **but although no accidents were a result of communication failure, several enquiries and Boards of Discipline had strongly recommended a pilot be stationed at the VTC because they felt poor communication had been a major contributory factor.** The meeting

agreed to put the 'VTC Pilot Scheme' on hold and delete this item from the agenda.

(iv) **Proposed Berthing Guideline Amendments**

- M1669 13. Mr. LAM Tsan-wa briefed members on the proposed berthing amendments for Berth 1 & 2 of the River Trade Terminal. The proposal was discussed and recommended at the PAC Working Group meeting held on 21 January 1999 and supported by the WG members. The proposed amendments were endorsed.

VI. Any Other Business

(i) **PAC Paper No. 3/99 "Tug Requirements for Vessels Berthing/Unberthing at Sha Chau Oil Terminal"**

- M1670 14. Mr. George KWOK presented the paper. HKPA agreed to conduct trials with a view to establishing the tug requirements for small tankers under 130 meters which were equipped with a bow thruster of less than 800 horsepower.

(ii) **Pilotage Dues**

- M1671 15. Mr. LAM Tsan-wa tabled a joint proposal between HKPA, HK Liner Shipping Association and the Shipping committee of the General Chamber of Commerce for the revision of pilotage dues for the years 1999 and 2000 (Proposal attached at Appendix II). The proposal was endorsed.

(iii) **West Lamma Pilot Boarding Station**

- M1672 16. Mr. P. J. WU tabled a chart of the proposed West Lamma Pilot Boarding Station (PBS)(Chart attached at Appendix III). He requested the meeting to expedite the process of replacing the Green Island PBS by a new PBS at the West Lamma Channel as marked. He envisaged that the West Lamma PBS would help to alleviate the traffic congestion at the East Lamma Channel. He informed members that HKPA was ready in all aspects for the operation. The meeting endorsed the proposal to establish a PBS at West Lamma Channel and to delete the Green Island PBS.

17. There being no other business and the meeting was ended at 12:10 p.m.

V. Date of next meeting

- M1673 18. The date of next meeting was scheduled to be held on 14 April 1999.