Translation

LOCAL VESSELS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Joint Sub-committee on Class I and Class IV Vessels

Minutes of the 1st Meeting

Date : 8 November 2012 (Thursday)

Time : 10:10 a.m.

Place : Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building, Central

Present

Mr. CHAN Cheuk-sang Marine Department (MD)

(Chairman)

Mr. WONG Sai-fat MD

(Chairman)

Mr. KWOK Tak-kee Hong Kong & Kowloon Motor Boats & Tug Boats

Association Ltd. (MBTA)

Mr. WEN Tsz-kit Hong Kong & Kowloon Motor Boats & Tug Boats

Association Ltd. (MBTA)

Mr. NG Siu-yuen, Nelson Hong Kong & Kowloon Ferry Ltd. (HKKF)

Mr. WU Ka-shun South China Towing Co. Ltd. (SCT)

Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai

Mr. P. M. LEE, Alfred

Mr. LI Kin-wah

New World First Ferry Services Ltd. (First Ferry)

New World First Ferry Services Ltd. (First Ferry)

New World First Ferry Services Ltd. (First Ferry)

Hong Kong Seamen's Union (HKSU)

Mr. CHOR Yee-on The Hongkong and Yaumati Ferry Co. Ltd. (HYF)
Mr. Bill CHAN Discovery Bay Transportation Services Ltd. (DBTPL)

Mr. LO Ngok-yang Cheoy Lee Shipyards Limited (Cheoy Lee)

Mr. FAN Keung Harbour Transportation Workers General Union (HTWGU)

Mr. LAI Hoi-ping Harbour Transportation Workers General Union (HTWGU)

Mr. LEE Shing-hing Sai Kung Kaito Association

Mr. Donald LEE Hong Kong Water Ski Association (HKWSA)

Mr. CHEUNG Yat-leung, Sai Kung Yacht Association

Jacky

Mr. Roger EASTHAM Royal Hong Kong Yacht Club (RHKYC)

Mr. CHEUNG Sun-ming

Dr. LAU Kwok-lam, Alan

Hebe Haven Yacht Club

Pleasure Boating Operations

Mr. Albert WU Gold Coast Yacht and Country Club (Gold Coast)

- 1 -

Mr. KWOK Chi-hong Marine Excursion Association (MEA)
Mr. WONG Yiu-wah Marine Excursion Association (MEA)

Mr. MA Chi-wai The Hong Kong Shipyard Limited (HK Shipyard)
Mr. CHAN Chi-ming The Hong Kong Shipyard Limited (HK Shipyard)
Mr. KEUNG Siu-fai Hong Kong & Kowloon Floating Fishermen Welfare

Promotion Association

Mr. CHEUNG Yau-kwong Fat Tat Hong

Mr. MAK On-ki, Andrew Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD)

Mr. CHAN Hon-bun MD
Mr. LI Kin-pong, Warren MD
Mr. Shuen Chi-keung, Ivan MD
Mr. WONG Wing-chuen MD
Mr. Clement HAU MD

(Secretary)

Absent with Apologies

Mr. Keith MOWSER Hong Kong Sailing Federation (HKSF)

Ms. CHING Ngon-lai Harbour Transportation Workers General Union (HTWGU)/

Small Craft Workers Union

Mr. Paul CHEUNG Hong Kong Jet Sports Boating Association (HKJSBA)

Mr. Alan REID Hebe Haven Yacht Club

Mr. CHEUNG Chi-chuen Hong Kong & Kowloon Fishermen Association

Mr. Chris WONG

Discovery Bay Transportation Services Ltd. (DBTPL)

Ms. YAU Lai-sze, Lizzy LCSD

Ms. NG Kam-han Transport Department (TD)

Mr. YUEN Wing-cheong TD
Mr. CHEUNG Sik-woon MD

I. Opening Remarks

Mr. CHAN Cheuk-sang (MD) and Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD) welcomed all industry representatives to the meeting. Mr. CHAN explained the purpose and the agenda of the meeting to members and introduced the government representatives present at the meeting. Mr. CHAN wished to collect views of the industry through discussions at the meeting for implementation of new measures to enhance maritime safety.

II. Discussion Items

1. Marine Traffic Control and Safety Measures

- 2. Mr. CHAN Cheuk-sang (MD) began by briefing members on the first agenda item, stating that marine traffic control measures had been adopted by the Administration for fireworks displays or other major events in the harbour since the early 1990s, and that details could be found in paragraph 6 of Paper No. 1/2012. Since such measures were for guidance purpose only, there were difficulties in law enforcement. MD noted the speeding problem of a small number of departing vessels after the completion of fireworks displays or other major events in the past. Mr. CHAN informed the meeting that a working group would follow up the problem of speeding vessels and invited members to give their views to the working group for making the harbour of Hong Kong safer. MD would meet relevant government departments on 20 November to discuss and formulate the direction and principles for handling the matter, and would meet industry representatives on 27 November for further discussions. MD would present conclusions drawn from the discussions of the working group to the industry at subsequent meetings of this sub-committee. On another front, MD was preparing to promote the awareness of the public and the industry on the importance of maritime safety and the points to note through various channels such as television, radio, posters and leaflets. The promotional activities were expected to be launched before Christmas.
- 3. **Mr. Warren LI Kin-pong (MD)** added that he hoped in the long run the problem of confusion caused by departing vessels upon the completion of events could be resolved, and sound measures would be put in place for dispersal of vessels.
- 4. **Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai (First Ferry)** said he hoped the Government would explain to the public the arrangements on re-opening of the harbour lest some discontented passengers would press coxswains to set sail before the complete dispersal of vessels.
- 5. **Mr. NG Siu-yuen, Nelson (HKKF)** pointed out that the presence of a great number of vessels during holidays would easily give rise to dangerous incidents. He hoped the Government would perform its work of co-ordination well.
- 6. **Mr. CHEUNG Yat-leung, Jacky (Sai Kung Yacht Association)** raised two points: firstly, consideration should be given to holding fireworks displays either earlier or later in the evening as the displays fell within a period of heavy marine traffic and

accidents might easily occur; secondly, the Government must take action against non-compliant, speeding vessels and should consider following the Traffic Police's example by introducing such technology as the use of laser gun for speed detection to facilitate prosecution of speeding vessels.

- 7. **Mr. LI Kin-pong, Warren** (**MD**) replied that existing measures would be reviewed so as to identify a long-term solution. **Mr. LI** said the existing measures could not be used to intercept every speeding vessel and other vessels might be endangered in the interception process. MD was studying ways to re-open the Restricted Area by removing its eastern and western boundaries in a gradual and systematic manner instead of at one go so as to avoid vessels scrambling for piers for disembarking passengers causing chaos and speeding. However, the proposal had yet to be discussed with the Marine Police, and the issue of vessels converging in the harbour after the re-opening had to be resolved. As regards the prosecution of speeding vessels, MD had yet to identify effective means to intercept such vessels without endangering law enforcement vessels and other vessels in the process. **Mr. LI** encouraged the industry to make more suggestions to enhance maritime safety.
- 8. **Mr. Donald LEE (HKWSA)** said a more proactive approach should be adopted to tackle the problem of speeding. **Mr. LEE** suggested that, before the commencement of a fireworks display, conspicuous yellow warning banners should be mounted on the sea and loudspeakers used to warn vessels against speeding and make it known that any video taken would be used for prosecution purpose.
- 9. **Mr. Roger EASTHAM (RHKYC)** made two suggestions: First of all, MD had to step up monitoring of vessels. He proposed introducing a permit system, which would allow MD to keep a record of the contact information of the vessels engaged in fireworks viewing, and ensure that yacht clubs would be able to manage vessels more effectively. Second, MD might consider making use of the Automatic Identification System (AIS), and study the admissibility of data collected by AIS as evidence in court.
- 10. **Mr. CHAN Cheuk-sang (MD)** responded that the Government had considered establishing a permit system for pleasure vessels. However, it still had to consider various factors and the method of implementation, and study the potential effectiveness of such a system. The use of AIS would be discussed in the meeting of another working group. The Government would positively consider making use of it. **Mr. CHAN** said AIS was a rather reliable system, but whether its data would be admissible as evidence in court hinged on the circumstances of individual cases and the requirements of the Evidence Ordinance.

- 11. **Mr. CHEUNG Yau-kwong (Fat Tat Hong)** observed that speeding occurred after the completion of events when vessels hurried back to piers to scramble for a berth. Other vessels, rocked by the speeding vessels, had no choice but to speed up as well. **Mr. CHEUNG** suggested that the Government step up prosecution in the way that it had tackled speeding vehicles on the road. If necessary, consideration should be given to cancelling the coxswain's licence. Video-recording at the piers might also be considered to achieve better deterrent effect.
- 12. **Mr. FAN Keung (HTWGU)** remarked that coxswains often navigated their vessels over the speed limit under the instruction of their employers. In this connection, he hoped that the Government would step up publicity efforts and that crew members would not be made the only target when penalty provisions were formulated.
- 13. **Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai (First Ferry)** pointed out that some pleasure vessels of new design had speeding problems and did not follow their navigational channels. Some pleasure vessels were also found to have berthed at ferry piers. Given the frequency of such occurrences, complaints had been made to the Vessel Traffic Centre.
- 14. **Mr. LI Kin-pong, Warren (MD)** responded that MD's Harbour Patrol Section would step up patrol and take follow-up actions against non-compliant vessels.
- 15. **Mr. KWOK Tak-kee (MBTA)** said that speeding of vessels after the completion of major events had for years been a subject of discussion but no concrete action had been taken all along. **Mr. KWOK** suggested that pursuit and interception had to be initiated even though prosecution was difficult so as to at least slow down and take photographs of the speeding vessels for prosecution purpose. It was hoped that such actions would have a deterrent effect.
- 16. **Mr. CHEUNG Yat-leung, Jacky (Sai Kung Yacht Association)** remarked that pleasure vessels let for hire generally would not be operated at a high speed but the problem lay with some privately owned pleasure vessels which were often affected by other vessels. As many yacht clubs were not invited to this meeting, **Mr. CHEUNG** suggested MD should issue guidelines to all pleasure vessel owners and yacht clubs in Hong Kong to remind them of the importance of navigational safety and the points to note when viewing fireworks displays.
- 17. **Mr. Donald LEE (HKWSA)** said it was necessary for the public to understand that speeding was illegal and so the Government had to beef up publicity. Moreover, the Government should make use of the high speed craft of the Police and the Customs

and Excise Department in the interception of speeding vessels. **Mr. LEE** also suggested that MD should procure high speed craft for interception of speeding vessels.

- 18. **Dr. LAU Kwok-lam, Alan (Pleasure Boating Operations)** reminded the meeting that crews were only paid staff, who had no alternative but to follow instructions of their employers, who might very often be unaware of Hong Kong's maritime legislation. Besides, **Dr. LAU** stated that the effect of posters and leaflets was very limited and many pleasure vessel owners did not read newsletters of yacht clubs.
- 19. **Mr. Albert WU** (**Gold Coast**) said the club members prosecuted were very often the same group of repeat offenders. He suggested that something be done to shame them into compliance with the law.
- 20. **Mr. CHAN Cheuk-sang (MD)** concluded the discussion by firstly expressing gratitude to the industry for its invaluable views. Mr. CHAN said it was a challenge to exercise control on speeding vessels in waters and the department would strive to enhance measures for ensuring maritime safety. MD was seeking advice from the Department of Justice with a view to securing a sound legal basis for the measures. As regards the vessel owners, **Mr. CHAN** said the department had considered enhancing maritime safety by implementing certain initiatives through multi-pronged means that included the issue of guidelines and publicity campaigns.

2. Local Examination Syllabuses and System for Certification

21. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** briefed the meeting on the second item on the agenda, saying that at the LVAC meeting held on 26 October the department had a detailed discussion with representatives from the industry on issues identified during vessel safety inspections, safety equipment and safety management, safety awareness and safety measures that could be put in place instantly. It was agreed at the meeting that a review had to be conducted on the examination syllabuses and examination systems for the certification of coxswains of local passenger carrying vessels and operators of pleasure vessels for hire, with improvement measures to be put forward to enhance maritime safety. Five areas were to be considered for improvement under the review, details of which were given in paragraph 3 of Paper No. 2/2012. The examination syllabuses for coxswains of local vessels and pleasure vessel operators were set out in Annex 1 of Paper No. 2/2012 to give the industry a rough idea of the scope of examination for different classes of certificates. **Mr. WONG** stated it was raised in the previous meeting that the examinations did not cover awareness of

navigational safety and emergency preparedness. **Mr. WONG** hoped that through this meeting the direction for the implementation of improvement measures could be set and views of the industry could be gathered.

- 22. **Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai (First Ferry)** stated that the proportion of practical training in the professional training for coxswains could be raised, such as testing the responsiveness of coxswains in operating high speed craft during practical examinations. In addition, **Mr. CHEUNG** said, with the maritime industry aging, succession problems had emerged. Coxswains aged over 50, though well experienced, lacked motivation, while younger coxswains who were about 30 years old generally lacked experience. **Mr. CHEUNG** thus suggested enhancing training for the younger generation and attracting new blood proactively.
- 23. In response, **Mr. WONG Sai-fat** (**MD**) said it was hoped that measures to enhance coxswains' professionalism in seamanship could be laid down through discussions at the meeting. He stressed that some of the measures would only be applicable to coxswains of local passenger carrying vessels and operators of pleasure vessels for hire. Considering that coxswains holding Grade 1 Certificate were not necessarily able to operate fast speed vessels, **Mr. WONG** said one of the options was to define the type rating of fast speed vessels. The issue of bringing new blood to the industry would not be discussed in this meeting.
- 24. **Mr. KWOK Tak-kee (MBTA)** said coxswains currently holding Grade 1 Certificate had at least 5 to 6 years of experience and were able to operate vessels of under 1 600 GRT. **Mr. KWOK** also inquired about the definition of high speed craft.
- 25. **Mr. WONG Wing-chuen (MD)** said the definition of high speed craft, a type of dynamically supported craft, was formula-based under the local legislation, but there was no definition for fast speed vessels. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** added that MD would evaluate the definition of fast speed vessels operating within local waters. As for the examination syllabuses, the department was considering enhancing them with contents on sailing attitude, navigational safety and emergency preparedness, and was exploring the need for coxswains of fast speed vessels to be issued with Type Rating Certificates.
- 26. **Mr. KWOK Chi-hong (MEA)** said the accident of October 1 was an isolated incident. The development of the industry and the relevant professions would be affected if the revised examination systems of 2007 were to be complicated as a result of the incident.

- 27. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** responded that he agreed with the amendments made in 2007, and that MD had no intention of upsetting the existing examination system or complicating it. MD only intended to further enhance navigational safety through amendments. **Mr. WONG** emphasised again that the proposed measures were mainly targeted at coxswains of local passenger carrying vessels and operators of pleasure vessels for hire. Coxswains would have the opportunity to refresh and update their knowledge and be able to maintain their professional standards.
- 28. **Dr. LAU Kwok-lam, Alan (Pleasure Boating Operations)** agreed in principle that there was room for amendment. However, he emphasised that since the accident was an isolated incident, adding new elements to the examination might not necessarily help. He believed the matter could be reviewed after the release of the Government's investigation findings.
- 29. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** responded that, with the investigation still ongoing, there had been no official explanation for the cause of the incident. However, that did not mean that improvement measures could not be introduced to enhance the examination system. The efforts of all relevant parties in this regard would be understood by the public as the industry's continuous endeavours to enhance maritime safety.
- 30. **Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai (First Ferry)** said knowledge of safety awareness could be provided in the form of refresher courses instead of tested under the existing examination system.
- 31. **Mr. NG Siu-yuen, Nelson (HKKF)** agreed on enhancing the examination system and offering courses to help coxswains refresh and update their knowledge, but he hoped any amendment made would not add pressure to coxswains.
- 32. **Mr. P. M. LEE, Alfred (First Ferry)** said introduction of a demerit point system could be considered, but courses for coxswains which were complicated in content and offered in a series should be avoided.
- 33. **Mr. WONG Yiu-wah** (**MEA**) hoped that any licence issued could remain valid for a long period of time, especially for licences issued to those who had continuously worked in the industry for a long time. **Mr. WONG** also encouraged MD to consider whether there were enough crew working in the wheelhouse of passenger carrying vessels.

- 34. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** responded that the issue of manning would be discussed in another sub-committee.
- 35. **Mr. LAI Hoi-ping (HTWGU)** suggested that shipping companies take on the responsibility to report coxswains' performance to MD at regular intervals and give due recognition to coxswains who performed well. In this way, coxswains would know that they had to keep learning even after they had been issued with a licence.
- 36. **Mr. Roger EASTHAM** (**RHKYC**) said members of the Club were concerned about the speed of vessels and believed that it was necessary to define "high speed craft." In addition, competency to operate high speed craft should be proved by satisfaction of additional requirements, which could be reviewed on a regular basis.
- 37. **Mr. CHEUNG Yau-kwong (Fat Tat Hong)** said crews did not have high academic qualifications and he was worried they would not perform well in the written examination. **Mr. CHEUNG** also pointed out that there were relatively few vessel collisions as compared to car crashes. Coxswains generally had rich experience. Over-regulation would hinder the development of the industry.
- 38. **Mr. KEUNG Siu-fai (Hong Kong & Kowloon Floating Fisherman Welfare Promotion Association Ltd.)** suggested that the examination systems should not be amended hastily every time after an incident happened. Besides, the work of safety awareness promotion should be directed towards all vessels, not just local passenger carrying vessels.
- 39. **Mr. KWOK Tak-kee** (**MBTA**) emphasised the importance of experience and stated that practical experience was necessary when responding to emergencies.
- 40. **Mr. CHEUNG Yat-leung, Jacky** (**Sai Kung Yacht Club**) said in crew recruitment, an employer had to consider the applicant's conduct as well as his experience. **Mr. CHEUNG** said marine accidents, though relatively few in number, aroused more public concern when they did happen. He suggested that the Government review the examination system, but urged that it should not go beyond what was reasonable in doing so. Moreover, **Mr. CHEUNG** suggested adding a practical examination to the current examination for Grade 2 Certificate.
- 41. **Mr. WEN Tsz-kit (MBTA)** said holders of Coxswain Grade 2 Certificate were generally rather experienced. He was worried amending the examination system would hinder the development of the industry. He suggested that the Government

focus on improving the sailing attitude of coxswains and imposing harsher penalties on coxswains who did not comply with the requirements.

- 42. **Mr. FAN Keung (HTWGU)** said that the Maritime Services Training Institute failed to provide adequate courses for coxswains. Private institutions very often charged higher tuition fees for courses that were shorter in terms of hours, and the choice of courses is also very limited, giving the coxswains a lack of flexibility. HTWGU currently offered a training course of 36 hours for coxswains, charging a tuition fee lower than those demanded by private institutions. However, it seemed that the choice of training was still limited for coxswains. **Mr. FAN** hoped MD could develop a well-defined training system and provide more information on training for coxswains.
- 43. Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD) concluded the discussion by thanking the industry for its invaluable views and stressed again that the proposed measures were mainly targeted at coxswains of local passenger carrying vessels and operators of pleasure vessels for hire. Mr. WONG hoped that, by setting a clear direction, MD could introduce improvement measures to strengthen the existing examination systems so that navigational safety standards could be enhanced. Mr. WONG stressed again that MD had no intention to upset the existing examination system. Views expressed at the meeting indicated that the industry did not object to enhancing coxswains' awareness of navigational safety and knowledge of emergency preparedness. By enhancing the examination system, MD wished to encourage coxswains to pursue continuing studies so that they would have a chance to refresh and update their knowledge constantly, and thereby maintain their professional standards. On another front, MD would continue to study the need of defining fast speed vessels and establishing a type rating certification system for it. It would also study the need of requiring applicants for coxswain examinations to take a practical examination so as to ensure that certificated coxswains were competent to operate fast speed vessels. Since MD might not have adequate resources to conduct the large number of practical examinations required for the applicants, the use of ship simulator would be considered. However, MD understood that some applicants for coxswain examinations might not be used to using the system. It therefore would remain open to diverse views with a view to coming up with an appropriate improvement plan. Different views, such as proof of the navigational performance of coxswains by employers, provision of courses for enhancing navigational knowledge at sea, etc., expressed by members were also noted. Moreover, Mr. WONG reminded the meeting that legislative amendments would have to be considered if the Government needed to impose harsher penalties on non-compliant coxswains. Mr. WONG said he looked forward to receiving more

views from members and hoped that a preliminary consensus could be reached by February next year.

3. Working Hours of Coxswains and Crew, and Review of Their Duty Roster System for Local Passenger Carrying Vessels

- 44. Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD) briefed members on the third agenda item, stating that there was a need to review the duty roster and working/rest time arrangements for crew of local passenger carrying vessels, details of which were given in paragraph 3 of Paper No. 3/2012. The first issue to be explored was whether the crew had adequate There were at present no clear rules on working/rest time arrangements for crew. The current labour legislation did not provide for maximum or minimum working hours. According to the working arrangements for crew of vessels plying between Hong Kong and Macao, coxswains worked no more than 11 hours during the daytime and no more than 240 hours each month. There were breaks between voyages and crew of vessels on night service were normally required to make two round trips between Hong Kong and Macao only. At the previous Local Vessels Advisory Committee meeting, the industry had pointed out that coxswains did not have time for lunch or going to the toilet. Mr. WONG hoped a standard for working/rest time arrangements for crew to be complied with by the industry could be set through discussions at the meeting. He also hoped a code of practice for arrangements on extra ferry services could be established.
- 45. **Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai (First Ferry)** said since the transport industry had been split up, it did not have sufficient resources for redeployment. He therefore urged TD to step in to assist in resolving the problem with a view to improving the arrangements for extra services and on manpower.
- 46. **Mr. KWOK Chi-hong (MEA)** said the number of hours spent on navigation by a crew member was different from his duty hours and it would be difficult to set a uniform standard for the whole industry.
- 47. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** responded that TD was responsible for licensing. Since TD was not represented at the meeting on that day, MD could not respond on TD's behalf. According to the information available, MD understood that the crew were normally deployed to work on a "one-day-on and one-day-off" system, and while they were on duty, they did not work for 24 consecutive hours.

- 48. **Mr. P. M. LEE, Alfred (First Ferry)** remarked that the existing "one-day-on and one-day-off" work arrangement was a common practice in the industry. Seamen were happy with the arrangement, but they would like to know whether MD had taken a view on this issue.
- 49. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** responded that he knew there were mixed views on the working and rest time arrangements within the unions. Some seamen were satisfied with the existing system while others were not. The points to consider now included sailing arrangement, duty roster schedule and whether crew made good use of their free time to rest. **Mr. WONG** encouraged members to provide information in respect of crew's working hours in other countries to help work out working time arrangements suitable for local crew.
- 50. **Mr. CHEUNG Yat-leung, Jacky (Sai Kung Yacht Association)** remarked that the industry was generally content with the "one-day-on and one-day-off" arrangement and such arrangement had run smoothly. The main point now should be to address public concerns and make sure they understood that crew should have sufficient time to rest.
- 51. **Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-wai (First Ferry)** commented that as the unions might not have consulted all of their members when various surveys were conducted, it was doubtful whether some of the findings were representative.
- 52. **Mr. KWOK Tak-kee (MBTA)** hoped that consensus could be reached between the unions and the employers. **Mr. KWOK** disagreed with the "8-hour-work and 16-hour-off" proposal as the existing "one-day-on and one-day-off" arrangement had been operating effectively.
- 53. **Mr. WEN Tsz-kit (MBTA)** pointed out that crews should be able to properly manage their duty hours and allocate the time for lunch, toilet and rest.
- 54. **Mr. Roger EASTHAM (Royal Hong Kong Yacht Club)** would like to know the role of the Labour Department (LD) in this issue. Understanding that the Government could not legislate on every detail, he suggested MD provide guidelines for the industry.
- 55. **Mr. WONG Sai-fat (MD)** agreed that it was not possible to legislate on every single detail. He added that, in his understanding, LD would normally respect the practice of individual industries when making arrangements for working hours. **Mr.**

WONG concluded the discussion. Once again, he thanked members for their valuable contributions and maintained that MD remained open to recommendations from the industry. Future meetings would continue with discussions on this issue. Once a benchmark agreed by the industry had been set, it was imperative the industry exercise self-discipline for effective implementation.

III. Details of the next meeting

56. The next meeting would be held on Thursday, 29 November 2012 at 10:00 a.m., in Conference Room A, 24/F, Harbour Building.

IV. End of meeting

57. There being no other business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:10 p.m.